**Figure S1**

*A Subtractive Approach: Results of Subtracting Punisher Rates from Reinforcer Rates*

**A black background with a black square

Description automatically generated with medium confidence**

*Note.* Resulting outcome rates when subtracting punisher rates directly from reinforcer rates (Equations 7-8). P1=Phase 1; P2=Phase 2; P3=Phase 3; P4=Phase 4.

**Figure S2**

*A Subtractive Approach: Target and Alternative Value*

**A black background with a black square

Description automatically generated with medium confidence**

*Note.* Resulting values when subtracting punisher rates directly from reinforcer rates (Equations 7-8). P1=Phase 1; P2=Phase 2; P3=Phase 3; P4=Phase 4.

**Figure S3**

*A Subtractive Approach: Probability of Target Responding*

**A graph with colorful lines

Description automatically generated**

*Note.* Resulting target probabilities when subtracting punisher rates directly from reinforcer rates (Equations 7-8). P1=Phase 1; P2=Phase 2; P3=Phase 3; P4=Phase 4. Note that probabilities fall outside of the acceptable range for probabilities (0-1; e.g., Group Low, P4).

**Figure S4**

*Adjusting aR to Account for Differential Resurgence in Phase 3*

A graph of different colored lines

Description automatically generated

*Note.* This figure presents fits of the competitive-valuation model as shown in the right panels of Figure 3. All parameters are identical to Figure 3 with the exception of *aR* (Equation 17). *aR* was changed from .12 (Figure 3) to .90 in the present figure. P2=Phase 2; P3=Phase 3; P4=Phase 4.